

## A Study on the 1st and 3rd Syllables in Five-Syllable Regulated Verse

Park Min-Woong\*

### 【목 차】

1. Introduction
2. The basic prosody of regulated verse described in the *Hanyu shilü xue*
3. On the odd-numbered syllables
  - 1) The well-known "formular" and the "remedy"
  - 2) On the first syllable
  - 3) On the third syllable
4. Conclusion

### 【초록】

This is a study on the first and third syllables in five-syllable regulated verse along with the examples of poems written by Wang Wei 王維 (699-761). In this paper, I try to examine "The free alternation for 1, 3, 5" (一三五不論) on the basis of the poetic theories performed in the following two books; Wang Li's 王力 (1900-1986) *Hanyu shilü xue* 漢語詩律學 and Kūkai's 空海 (774-835) *Bunkyo hifuron* 文鏡秘府論. In order to get this result, the various poetic theories and arguments of Wang Li and Kūkai are examined.

【키워드】 First Syllable, Third Syllable, Couplet, Regulated Verse, Alternation, Formular

---

\* 서경대학교 국제비즈니스어학부 부교수 (mwp1112@hotmail.com)

## 1. Introduction

During the Tang dynasty (618–907), which is generally regarded as the golden age of the Chinese poetry, a new form of poetry arose. It is the modern-style poetry (*jinti shi* 近體詩) which is also called the regulated verse (*lǜshi* 律詩). The most distinguishing feature is the use of a prosodic rhythm based on the alternation of level and deflected tones.<sup>1)</sup> The regulated verse is not only a general term covering several specific varieties of Tang poetry, but also a specific term for one particular variety.<sup>2)</sup>

Talking about the prosody of the regulated verse of the Tang, we would often refer to a particular formula known to be widely accepted, although its origin is not clear. It is the so-called “The free alternation for 1, 3, 5 (the 1st, 3rd, 5th syllables) and the strict regulation for 2, 4, 6 (the 2nd, 4th, 6th syllables)” (一三五不論, 二四六分明) (hereafter “1, 3, 5 formula”). By the way, through a careful examination, we can see the first part of the formula is inaccurate and unacceptable, as well as inconsistent with the writing practice of the Tang. As a matter of fact, it has been already pointed out by a modern scholar Wang Li 王力 (1900–1986) in his *Hanyu shilü xue* 漢語詩律學.<sup>3)</sup>

At the present time, Wang Li's *Hanyu shilü xue* is acknowledged as an authoritative book to study the Chinese prosody. In this well organized book, the regulated verse is discussed and analysed in detail together with the other important Chinese verses such as the old-style poetry (*guti shi* 古體詩), the lyrics (*ci* 詞) of the Song dynasty (960–1279) and the aria (*qu* 曲) of the Yuan dynasty (1260–1368) including the vernacular poetry and the Europeanized poetry. Although the author says in the preface of the book that it was primarily written to teach and introduce the common sense about the basic knowledge of prosody,<sup>4)</sup> it is actually a summation of the historic studies on poetry including the author's own opinions.

In studying the Chinese prosody, there is another important book titled the *Bunkyo hifu*

1) See Wang Li 王力 (1900–1986), *Hanyu shilü xue* 漢語詩律學 (Shanghai: Shanghai jiaoyu chubanshe, 2002), 19; For Korean translation, see Wang Ryeok 왕력(王力), *Junggug siyul hak 1* 중국시율학1, trans. by Song Yongjun 송용준 (Seoul: Somyeong chulpan, 2005), pp.47–48. “The pattern of this alternation is called tonal prosody. In its final form in the Tang, tonal prosody required the contrast of tones within the line and between the two lines of a couplet, and the mirror-symmetry of the two couplets of a quatrain and the two quatrains of a complete poem. Not until the latter part of the fifth century did Chinese scholars in the south realize that their own language was tonal.” William H. Nienhauser et al., comp., *The Indiana Companion to Traditional Chinese Literature* (Bloomington, Indiana: Indiana UP, 1986), p.684.

2) Nienhauser, *The Indiana Companion*, p.683.

3) See Wang, *Hanyu shilü xue*, 85–86; Wang Ryeok, *Junggug siyul hak 1*, pp.180–182.

4) Wang, *Hanyu shilü xue*, 1–3; *Junggug siyul hak 1*, pp.7–9.

ron 文鏡秘府論 by a Japanese Buddhist monk, Kūkai 空海 (774–835).<sup>5)</sup> This book contains the first detailed description of the “eight faults” (*babing* 八病)<sup>6)</sup> raised by Shen Yue 沈約 (441–513).<sup>7)</sup> This book is also a summarizing work for important Tang and pre-Tang texts on poetic theory and prosodic techniques. Some of the original texts quoted in this book have been already lost in China. For this reason, this book is considered even more valuable for textual criticism.

As mentioned above, Wang Li deals with the “1, 3, 5 formula” in his book. And, according to the poetic theories in the *Bunkyo hifuron*, we can obviously see that the choice of tone for the odd-numbered syllables of a line in the regulated verse was rigorously regulated in the writing practice of the Tang. In this paper, I try to study this formula based on discussion of the poetic theories performed in the two books mentioned above, which were written in different times. The reason why the two books are chosen for this paper is because the *Bunkyo hifuron* is a record of the poetic theories in the Tang time when the regulated verse appeared and formed, and the *Hanyu shilü xue* is an authoritative work in which the author’s argument is based on the preceding studies and the practical development. That is, this paper is a study on the first and third syllables in five-syllable regulated verse with the examples of poems written by Wang Wei 王維 (699–761).

This paper has a few limitations: First, I only choose Wang Wei’s five-syllable regulated verse with level-beginning in the *Wang Youcheng ji jianzhu* 王右丞集箋注 compiled in 1736 by Zhao Diancheng 趙殿成 as the examples for the paper; Second, this paper is limited to analysis of the tonal pattern of the regulated verse.

5) See Yang Shoujing 楊守敬 (1839–1915), comp., *Riben fang shu zhi* 日本訪書志, *juan* 13 (Taipei: Guangwen shuju, 1967); see also <https://zh.wikisource.org/wiki/%E6%96%87%E9%8F%A1%E7%A7%98%E5%BA%9C%E8%AB%96> [2019.04.15.] For more information on this book and author, see Nienhauser, *The Indiana Companion*, pp.197–198. For English translation of the text of the *Bunkyo hifuron*, see Richard Wainwright Bodman, *Poetics and prosody in early mediaeval China: a study and translation of Kūkai’s Bunkyo hifuron*, Ph. D. dissertation (New York: Cornell University, 1978).

6) Shen Yue defines the “eight faults,” which describe eight undesirable euphonic effects to be avoided in poetry. Four have to do with rhyme and four with tone. This is to warn a writer away from any unintentional repetitions of tone or rhyme. Shen’s solution is to avoid using several words in succession that have the same tone in the second line of a couplet, and to avoid arranging the words in such a way that they repeat the same succession of tones as that found in the first line. In dealing with tonal effects, the four tones – level, rising, departing, and entering – are divided into two groups such as the level tone and the deflected tone. The application of Shen’s suggestions thus produces a kind of mirror image parallelism in the two lines of each couplet, words in important positions in the first line are in the level tone being matched in the second line by words that are in one of the deflected tones and vice versa. See Wang Ryeok, *Junggug siyul hak I*, pp.283–285, note 270 and 271.

7) Shen Yue, a poet and critic of the southern Qi 南齊 dynasty (479–502), is best known as the originator of the first deliberately applied rules of tonal euphony in the history of Chinese prosody. See Nienhauser, *The Indiana Companion*, pp.680–681.

## 2. The basic prosody of regulated verse described in the *Hanyu shilü xue*

Normally, regulated verse can be grouped into three major forms by the number of lines. The first is *lǚshī* as basic regulated verse which always has eight lines; the second is *páilǚ* 排律 created by repeating the quatrain as often as wanted; and the third is *jueju* 絕句 which has four lines only.<sup>8)</sup>

Regulated verse can be divided into lines of a fixed length – either five-syllable lines or seven-syllable lines, of which the even-numbered lines have a rhyme. A single rhyme has to be used throughout the poem. In practice, rhymes are most frequent in the level tone. The various tones of the spoken language are classifiable as “level” or “deflected” tone, which are also named “even” or “uneven” tone respectively. In a poem, certain tone patterns are imposed (which will be dealt in the later part of this paper). There are two important requirements for the regulated verse: First, the second line of a couplet is generated by matching each specified tone in the first line with its tonal opposite. Second, it always employs parallel-couplets in lines 3-4 and 5-6, and sometimes in lines 1-2 also. In a parallel-couplet, the words in the first line match their partners in the second line syntactically, while they often contrast themselves in meaning.<sup>9)</sup> Because the paper is limited to the Wang Wei’s five-syllable regulated verse with level-syllable beginning, the detailed analysis of the patterns is applied only to them.

Five-syllable regulated verse has two basic rules: First, it has eight lines with five syllables for each. Second, its regular form has lines 2, 4, 6 and 8 in the rhyme, and the variation has lines 1, 2, 4, 6 and 8 in the rhyme. The tonal patterns of five-syllable regulated verse depend on its two possible beginnings – the level-syllable beginning and the deflected-syllable beginning.<sup>10)</sup> And, variety in rhythm is achieved by alternating syllables in different tones such as level or deflected syllable. The pattern of this alternation is called tonal prosody. Its beginning are traced back to the Six Dynasties (225–589), when Shen Yue innovated prosody of the poetry by introducing the use of four tones which refer to *ping* 平 (level), *shang* 上 (rising), *qu* 去 (departing), and *ru* 入 (entering). These four tones can be regrouped into two; the level or the even tone (*ping* 平) which accounts for about half of all the syllables, and the deflected or the uneven tone (*ze* 仄) which accounts

8) For more information, see Wang, *Hanyu shilü xue*, 19–43. See also Nienhauser, *The Indiana Companion*, p.683.

9) For more information, see Wang, *Hanyu shilü xue*, 19–24. See also Nienhauser, *The Indiana Companion*, pp.684–685.

10) See Wang, *Hanyu shilü xue*, p.20.

for the other half of the syllables of rising, departing and entering tones.<sup>11)</sup>

The standard tonal patterns for level-beginning verse in level rhyme are as follows:<sup>12)</sup>  
[L=level, D=deflected, R=rhyme]

L L L D D (or L L D D L R, if rhymed, i.e. the variation)  
D D D L L R  
D D L L D  
L L D D L R  
L L L D D  
D D D L L R  
D D L L D  
L L D D L R

Wang Li has further simplified the tonal arrangement of five-syllable regulated verse into a list of four types of lines, which can be switched in the sequence according to the level or deflected beginnings as follows:<sup>13)</sup>

A: D D D L L      a: D D L L D  
B: L L D D L      b: L L L D D

The lines named by the capital letters A and B end in level tones, and the lines named a and b end in deflected tones. A and a types begin with deflected tones while B and b types begin with level tones. Therefore, the tonal pattern for level-beginning regular verse is as follows:<sup>14)</sup>

bA aB bA aB

The pattern for its variation (i.e. line 1 is in rhyme) is:

BA aB bA aB

In fact, only a few poems were strictly written on the basis of these standard rules. I found only two poems by Wang Wei which were close to the prosodic theories shown above. One is “Sending Cultivated Talent Sun” (送孫秀才). In this poem, the first syllables of the first line and the sixth line are out of order (i.e. underlined syllable):

11) See Wang, *Hanyu shiliti xue*, p.6. See also Nienhauser, *Indiana Companion*, p.684.

12) See Wang, *Hanyu shiliti xue*, p.74.

13) See Wang, *Hanyu shiliti xue*, p.77.

14) See Wang, *Hanyu shiliti xue*, pp.76-77.

(1) “送孫秀才”<sup>15)</sup>

帝城風日好, D L L D D  
 況復建平家. D D D L L R  
 玉枕雙文簟, D D L L D  
 金盤五色瓜. L L D D L R  
 山中無魯酒, L L L D D  
 松下飯胡麻. L D D L L R  
 莫厭田家苦, D D L L D  
 歸期遠復賒. L L D D L R

“Sending Cultivated Talent Sun”

In the capital, the wind and the sun are good,  
 Furthermore, I returned to Jianping's house.  
 A jade pillow on a double-patterned bamboo mat,  
 Five-colored cucumbers on a golden platter.  
 In the mountain, no Lu wine,  
 Under the pine tree, eating black sesame rice.  
 Don't detest the hardship of farmhouse,  
 Returning due date is far away.

Another famous poem “Answer to Vice-prefect Zhang” (酬張小府) is also close to the standard tonal pattern. In the poem, there are three wrong syllables. They are the first syllables of the lines 1, 6 and 7 (i.e. underlined syllables).

(2) “酬張小府”<sup>16)</sup>

晚年唯好靜, D L L D D  
 萬事不關心. D D D L L R  
 自顧無長策, D D L L D  
 空知返舊林. L L D D L R  
 松風吹解帶, L L L D D  
 山月照彈琴. L D D L L R  
 君問窮通理, L D L L D  
 漁歌入浦深. L L D D L R

“Answer to Vice-prefect Zhang”

In later years I like just to stand still,  
 All of the affairs, no interest at all.  
 Looking back, no long-term solution,

15) See *juan* 8 in *Wang Youcheng ji jianzhu* 王右丞集箋注. See also *juan* 126 in *Quan Tang shi* 全唐詩. <https://ctext.org/text.pl?node=129454&if=gb> [2019.04.20.]. In *juan* 129 *Quan Tang shi* and *Ta ng shi ji shi* 唐詩紀事, this poem is written by Wang Jin 王綰. See <https://ctext.org/text.pl?node=129917&if=gb> [2019.04.20.].

16) See *juan* 7 in *Wang Youcheng ji jianzhu*, *juan* 126 in *Quan Tang shi*. See also <https://ctext.org/text.pl?node=129193&if=gb> [2019.04.20.].

No choice but to return to hometown.  
 Blowing in the pine winds, untied my belt,  
 Mountain moon shining on me playing the lute.  
 You ask me on the principles of fluctuations,  
 A fishing song goes deep into the harbor.

### 3. On the odd-numbered syllables

#### 1) The well-known “formular” and the “remedy”

As mentioned earlier, there were only a few poems that actually strictly followed the regulated pattern. Therefore, for a long time, as far as the prosody of the regulated verse is concerned, a well-known phrase has coexisted with the following formular. It is the so-called “The free alternation for 1, 3, 5 and the strict regulation for 2, 4, 6.” Although the origin of the formular is not clear, according to Wang Li, the earliest text could be found in *Qieyun zhinan* 切韻指南.<sup>17)</sup> The meaning of this formular is explained as follows: in each line, the tones for the first, third, and fifth syllables can be freely alternated, while the tones for the second, fourth and sixth syllables of the line are strictly regulated. In the same way, this formular can be applied to five-syllable regulated verse, too. That is, it can be “The free alternation for 1 and 3; the strict regulation for 2 and 4.”<sup>18)</sup> However, Wang Li argues that this formular is merely a superficial observation and inconsistent with the facts. In fact, the odd-numbered syllables of a line may not be able to be freely alternated, and the even-numbered syllables of a line also may not be strictly regulated.<sup>19)</sup>

In fact, the tones for the odd-numbered syllables of a line is certainly important. This is pointed out in the *Bunkyō hifuron* by Kūkai. He refers to three techniques of harmonizing tones<sup>20)</sup> and the “eight faults.”<sup>21)</sup> Two of the three techniques – “changing the head”

17) See Liu Jian 劉鑑, ed. *Qieyun zhinan* 切韻指南 (Taipei: Xin wenfeng chuban gongsi, 1989). For this paper, it is quoted from Wang’s *Hanyu shilü xue*, p.85.

18) See Wang, *Hanyu shilü xue*, p.85.

19) See Wang, *Hanyu shilü xue*, pp.85–86.

20) “調聲之術，其例有三：一曰換頭，二曰護腰，三曰相承。” See the “Harmonizing tones” (*diaosheng* 調聲) in the *Tian juan* 天卷 of the *Bunkyō hifuron*, See Kūkai, *Bunkyō hifuron*, pp.14–15; see <https://zh.wikisource.org/wiki/%E6%96%87%E9%8F%A1%E7%A7%98%E5%BA%9C%E8%AB%96#調聲> [2019.04.20.]

21) See the “Twenty-eight faults” (*wen ershiba zhong bing* 文二十八種病) in the *Xi juan* 西卷 of the *Bunkyō hifuron*, See Kūkai, *Bunkyō hifuron*, p.181; See <https://zh.wikisource.org/wiki/%E6%96%87%E9%8F%A1%E7%A7%98%E5%BA%9C%E8%AB%96#文二十八種病> [2019.04.20.] For more information on the “eight faults,” see Wang Ryeok, *Junggug siyul hak 1*, pp.283–285.

(*huantou* 換頭) and “guarding the waist” (*huyao* 護腰) – are related to deal with the first and third syllables of a line.<sup>22)</sup> And four of the “eight faults” – “level head” (*pingtou* 平頭), “raised tail” (*shangwei* 上尾), “wasp’s waist” (*fengyao* 蜂腰), and “crane’s knee” (*hexi* 鶴膝) – are also related to treat the odd-numbered syllables of a line.<sup>23)</sup>

The reason for Shen Yue’s classification of “eight defects” is to warn the poet to break away from some deliberate repetition of tones. It is not difficult to know that the ancient critic’s theory is stricter than that of modern times in the regulations of tonal arrangement of the syllables.

The exceptional syllables which do not conform to the standard tonal rules are called *ao* 拗 (odd). The corresponding revisions which poets made for the exceptions are called *aojiu* 拗救 (odd remedy). In the *Hanyu shilü xue*, Wang Li summarizes three types of the odd-numbered syllable *ao* as follows:<sup>24)</sup>

A. The first syllable in A, a, b types of line; These places are more flexible for tonal alternation. Most times, it is not necessary to give any corresponding revision.

B. The third syllable in any lines; If the exception occurs, the corresponding revision may be allowed.

C. The first syllable in B type of line; If the exception occurs, the corresponding revision must be done.

Poets usually have remedies for the *ao* lines to avoid the “faults.” Generally, the remedy is supposed to be done like this; if a deflected syllable is placed at a level syllable’s place, correspondingly, a level syllable has to be replaced with a deflected syllable later and vice versa.<sup>25)</sup> The purpose of the remedy is to keep the line or the couplet in an appropriate rhythm so as to keep the whole poem in the proper rhythm. That is, there are two kinds of remedies; one is the remedy in the line and the other is the remedy in the couplet. These remedies will be shown as examples in the later sections, and those will prove that the well-known formula mentioned above was not an accepted practice in the Tang time.

## 2) On the first syllable

For five-syllable regulated verse, as mentioned in the section 2, there are four types of

22) See note 20. Third one is called “mutually compensating” (*xiangcheng* 相承). It will be dealt at the section 3.3.

23) The remaining four of the eight faults are *dayun* 大韻, *xiaoyun* 小韻, *zhengniu* 正紐, *pangniu* 旁紐. See note 21.

24) See Wang, *Hanyu shilü xue*, p.93.

25) See Wang, *Hanyu shilü xue*, pp.94–103.



lines such as A, a, B, and b. The free alternation for the first syllable of a line seems possible for all of them except B type. B type is a line with two level syllables at the beginning followed by two deflected syllables in sequence (i.e. L L D D L). By the way, if the first syllable has a deflected tone, the line will become “D L D D L,” where the second level-syllable is in situation of the “single level-tone” (*guping* 孤平).<sup>26)</sup> It is a case of committing the “single level-tone.” As a matter of fact, it is a taboo for the poets to commit the “single level-tone” in regulated verse for the rhythm of a line or a couplet. Wang Li shows us many examples that the poets definitely tried to avoid the “single level-tone” in the Tang. It means that the “1, 3, 5 formula” is not acceptable even though it is known to be acceptable. As shown in the examples, it is very clear that the avoidance of the “single level-tone” in a line was a common practice at the Tang time.<sup>27)</sup>

In order not to commit the “single level-tone” in a line, the first syllable of B type is strictly fixed in level tone. Therefore, it can be said that the well known “the free alternation for the first syllable” is not correct to B type of lines. The following are the five examples of B type among Wang Wei’s poems.

(3) “寄荊州張丞相” (To prime minister Zhang at Jingzhou)<sup>28)</sup>

舉世無相識，

終身思舊恩。 L L D D L

In all the world I have had no other friend

Whose kindness to remember all my life

(4) “寄荊州張丞相” (To prime minister Zhang at Jingzhou)

26) See Wang, *Hanyu shilü xue*, p.87. For more information on the “single level-tone,” see Wang Ryeok, *Junggug siyul hak 1*, pp.184-185, note 195.

27) Wang, *Hanyu shilü xue*, p.87, pp.99-100, p.103. Wang Li argues that the length of deflected tone is just a half of level tone (See Wang, *Hanyu shilü xue*, p.67). It is still a question if the length of the tones made Tang poets avoid the “single level-tone.” But the distinction between level and deflected tones has been a long-time discussion among scholars. In 1948, Zhou Fagao pointed out that level tone is longer than deflected tone. See Zhou Fagao 周法高, “Shuo ping ze” 說平仄, *Bulletin of the Institute of History and Philology Academia Sinica*, 13 (1948): pp.153-162. In 1970, Mei Zulin proved this idea and proposed that level tone was low-pitched and the other three were high-pitched. Mei Zulin 梅祖麟, “Tones and prosody in Middle Chinese and the origin of the rising tone,” *Harvard Journal of Asiatic Studies*, 30 (1970): pp.86-110. In 1976, Ding Bangxin had a different opinion. He suggested that the real difference between level and deflected tones is the contour. Level tone is an unchanging contour, while the other three have a changing contour. “Hence level tone, though not long in itself, could be prolonged; while deflected tones could not be prolonged.” See Ding Bangxin 丁邦新, “Ping ze xin kao” 平仄新考, *Bulletin of the Institute of History and Philology Academia Sinica*, 47.1 (1975): pp.1-15. See also Bodman, *Poetics and prosody in early mediaeval China*, pp.124-125.

28) See *juan 7* in *Wang Youcheng ji jianzhuzi*, *juan 126* in *Quan Tang shi*. See also <https://ctext.org/text.pl?node=129172&if=gb> [2019.04.20.]. For English translation, see G. W. Robinson, trans., *Poems of Wang Wei* (Harmondsworth: Penguin, 1973), p.92.

目盡南飛雁,  
何由寄一言. L L D D L  
I watch the wild geese southward out of sight,  
And I think how I may send a word to you

- (5) “輞川閑居贈裴秀才迪” (For Pei Di, while we were living quietly by the Wang River)<sup>29)</sup>

復值接輿醉,  
狂歌五柳前. L L D D L  
And here's another Jieyu drunk,  
Madly singing in front of Five Willows.

- (6) “山居秋暝” (In the hills at nightfall in autumn)<sup>30)</sup>

明月鬆間照,  
清泉石上流. L L D D L  
Bright moon shining between pines,  
Clear stream flowing over stones.

- (7) “山居秋暝” (In the hills at nightfall in autumn)

隨意春芳歇,  
王孫自可留. L L D D L  
Of course spring scents must fail,  
But you, my friend, you must stay.

It seems that Wang Wei was quite convinced of this avoidance. I was able to find that eighty-six B type of lines are in forty-one poems chosen for this paper, and only three of eighty-six have deflected tones in the first syllables. For the three syllables, Wang Wei made a few corresponding revision in the couplets. All of them are the first syllables of the second lines of the second couplets (i.e. aB combination) as seen below:

- (8) “歸嵩山作” (Return to Mount Sung)<sup>31)</sup>

流水如有意, L D L D D  
暮禽相與還. D L L D L  
And the water seemed to flow with a purpose,

29) See *juan 7* in *Wang Youcheng ji jianzhui*, *juan 126* in *Quan Tang shi*. See also <https://ctext.org/text.pl?node=129169&if=gb> [2019.04.20.]. For English translation, Robinson, *Poems of Wang Wei*, 109.

30) See *juan 7* in *Wang Youcheng ji jianzhui*, *juan 126* in *Quan Tang shi*. See also <https://ctext.org/text.pl?node=129328&if=gb> [2019.04.20.]. For English translation, Robinson, *Poems of Wang Wei*, p.75.

31) See *juan 7* in *Wang Youcheng ji jianzhui*, *juan 126* in *Quan Tang shi*. See also <https://ctext.org/text.pl?node=129334&if=gb> [2019.04.20.]. For English translation, Robinson, *Poems of Wang Wei*, p.88.

And in the evening the birds went back together.

(9) “輞川閑居” (Living quietly by the Wang River)<sup>32)</sup>

時倚簷前樹 L D L L D

遠看原上村 D L L D L

I often lean against a tree in front of my house,  
And look away to the villages down on the plain.

(10) “與盧象集朱家” (Gathering with Lu Xiang at Zhu’s house)<sup>33)</sup>

賞得新豐酒 D D L L D

復聞秦女箏 D L L D L

We got the famous Xinfeng wine on credit.  
Again, we listen the tune of Qin girl’s *zheng*.

All of B types in the above couplets have deflected tones at the beginning syllable where level tones should be placed. And, level tones are placed at the third syllables of the lines instead of the original deflected tones, thus avoidance of the “single level-tone” could be done. It is a typical remedy as Wang Li interpreted, which is a remedy in the line.<sup>34)</sup>

Meanwhile, there is no argument at all on the “single level-tone” in the *Bunkyō hifuron*. However, Kūkai gives a very detailed account of the first syllable when introducing the first technique of harmonizing tones. It is the “changing the head” as follows: In the first line, the first two syllables are level tones; and in the second line, the first two syllables are deflected tones (departing, rising, or entering);<sup>35)</sup> in the third line, the first two syllables are again deflected tones; and in the fourth line the first two syllables are level tones. In the fifth line, the first two syllables are again level tones; in the sixth line, the first two syllables are deflected tones; in the seventh line, the first two syllables are again deflected tones; and in the eighth line, the first two syllables are level tones. This sort of alternation named “changing both heads” (*shuanghuantou* 雙換頭), according to the author, is the best sort.<sup>36)</sup>

If it cannot be done like the above, it must be done like the following; the second syllable

32) See *juan 7* in *Wang Youcheng ji jianzhu*; *juan 126* in *Quan Tang shi*. See also <https://ctext.org/text.pl?node=129169&if=gb> [2019.04.20.]. For English translation, Robinson, *Poems of Wang Wei*, p.112.

33) See *juan 7* in *Wang Youcheng ji jianzhu*; *juan 126* in *Quan Tang shi*. See also <https://ctext.org/text.pl?node=129286&if=gb> [2019.04.20.].

34) See Wang, *Hanyu shilü xue*, pp.92-94.

35) Kūkai never mentions the word *ze* 仄 (deflected), but compares it with a level tone by referring to three tones – rising, departing and entering. Obviously he treats them differently, but it is in line with Shen Yue’s suggestion.

36) See Kūkai, *Bunkyō hifuron*, p.14. <https://zh.wikisource.org/wiki/%E6%96%87%E9%8F%A1%E7%A7%98%E5%BA%9C%E8%AB%96#調聲> [2019.04.20.]

ble of the first line must be a level tone and the second syllable of the second line must be a deflected tone, and the second syllable of the third line must be a deflected tone again, and the second syllable of the fourth line must be a level tone. In this way, it is alternated till the end of the piece, only the second syllables are changed.<sup>37)</sup>

If the first syllables of two lines in a couplet are level tones, there is no harm done. It is also called “changing the head,” but it falls short of the standard of “changing both heads.”<sup>38)</sup> The first syllables of two lines in a couplet could not be deflected tones, because the tonal pattern will be out of harmony.<sup>39)</sup>

Judging by Kūkai’s argument that the first syllables of two lines in a couplet could not be deflected tones, it is obvious that the first syllable of a line cannot be freely alternated. Therefore, it is easily assumed that at the Tang time, the tonal contrast between two lines of a couplet was strictly regulated. And it can be also found out in Kūkai’s description of “level head,” which is one of the “eight faults.” That is, “level head” means, in five-syllable poetry, the first syllable should not share the same tone with the sixth syllable (i.e. the first syllable in the next line), and the second syllable should not share the same tone with the seventh syllable (i.e. the second syllable in the next line). Kūkai also points out that the first syllables of the two lines (i.e. the first and sixth syllables) sharing a level tone were not considered to be a fault at the time. However, he argues that in the case of deflected tones, if even a single syllable has the same tone as another syllable, then it is a fault.”<sup>40)</sup>

Nevertheless, it is interesting that among Wang Wei’s forty-one poems, there are eleven couplets in which the two first syllables share the same tone. If we take a close look at the eleven couplets, a few things can be pointed out: First, according to Kūkai’s “changing the head,” these couplets are not the “best sort” but still the acceptable “changing the head.” Second, under the deflected tonal group, all of the eleven couplets are “faults.” But it is noticed that Kūkai does not use the word *ze 仄* (deflected tones) to refer to the three tones such as the rising, departing and entering tones which are grouped in the category of deflected tones (*ze 仄*). If the concept of “sharing the same tone” is to be applied to the three tones respectively, nine of Wang Wei’s “faults” can be excused, even if the remaining two are certainly “faults.” Third, unexpectedly, according to Wang Li’s arguments, none of the eleven couplets are wrong in prosody.

37) See note 36.

38) “其第一字與下句第一字用平不妨，此亦名為換頭，然不及雙換。” See note 36.

39) “又不得句頭第一字是去上入，次句頭用去上入，則聲不調也。” See note 36.

40) “上句第一字與下句第一字，同平聲不為病；同上去入聲一字即病。” Kūkai, *Bunkyo hifuron*, p.181. <http://zh.wikisource.org/wiki/%E6%96%87%E9%8F%A1%E7%A7%98%E5%BA%9C%E8%AB%96#文二十八種病> [2019.04.20.]; see also Wang Ryeok, *Junggug siyul hak 1*, p.284-285, note 271.

### 3) On the third syllable

For the third syllable, according to Wang Li, there are two types of pattern described as the standard pattern and the variation.<sup>41)</sup> Forty-five variations could be found among 328 lines in the forty-one poems. They are grouped according to the four types of lines as follows:

A: 2 variations	a: 7 variations
B: 20 variations	b: 16 variations

It is noticeable that more variations are used in B and b types than in A and a types. This is due to the composition of each type. The A type (D D D L L) can be changed into “D D L L L” (three level tones to the end), and the a type (D D L L D) can be changed into “D D D L D” (“D L D” ending). These two variations are closer to the old-style poetic form<sup>42)</sup> than the regulated verse patterns. Although Wang Wei wrote numerous old-style poems, he was quite rigorous to write the regulated verse. (The above-example variations are limited to Wang’s works only.) And for the harmonious tonal arrangement of the whole poem, Wang Wei made the appropriate revisions. The examples below are bA combinations, the third syllables of the first line are wrong.

- (11) “輞川閑居贈裴秀才迪” (For Pei Di, while we were living quietly by the Wang River)<sup>43)</sup>

寒山轉蒼翠, L L D L D  
 秋水日潺湲, L D D L L  
 Cool hills more deeply green  
 Sound of autumn streams all day

- (12) “歸嵩山作” (Return to Mount Sung)<sup>44)</sup>

清川帶長薄, L L D L D  
 車馬去閒閒, L D D L L

41) See Wang, *Hanyu shiliti xue*, pp.90–93.

42) The old-style poetry also contains five syllables per line. The number of lines was optional. Rhyming was usually by couplets, every other line ending in a rhyme which the poet was free to maintain or to change throughout the course of the poem. There were no rules regarding the placement of tones throughout the line, other than general requirements of euphony. Nienhauser, *Indiana Companion*, p.682.

43) See *juan 7* in *Wang Youcheng ji jianzhui*, *juan 126* in *Quan Tang shi*. See also <https://ctext.org/text.pl?node=129169&if=gb> [2019.04.20.]. For English translation, Robinson, *Poems of Wang Wei*, p.109.

44) See *juan 7* in *Wang Youcheng ji jianzhui*, *juan 126* in *Quan Tang shi*. See also <https://ctext.org/text.pl?node=129334&if=gb> [2019.04.20.]. For English translation, Robinson, *Poems of Wang Wei*, p.88.

The river ran clear between luxuriant banks  
And my carriage jogged along on its way.

(13) “汎前陂” (Drifting on the lake)<sup>45)</sup>

秋空自明迴, L L D L D

況復遠人間. D D D L L

The autumn sky is clear into the distance

The clearer so far from human habitation.

In his *Bunkyō hifuron*, Kūkai explains the second technique of harmonizing tones called the “guarding the waist” as in the following: In a five-syllable line, “the waist” is the third syllable. “Guarding” means that the waist of the first line of a couplet should not be the same tone as the waist of its second line. Moreover, these two waists may not belong to the group of deflected tones. But if both of them are level tones, there is no harm done.<sup>46)</sup>

According to this technique, all of the above three examples are “faults.” Wang Wei has eleven more couplets which are wrong. That is, the third syllables in the both lines of a couplet share deflected tones. They are supposed not to be the same tone each other. Nevertheless, most of them can be excused if they are reconsidered according to the groups of rising, departing and entering tones respectively. In example 11, *zhuan* 轉 belongs to the group of rising tone, and *ri* 日 belongs to the group of entering tone; in example 12, *dai* 帶 belongs to departing tone, while *qu* 去 rising tone; in example 13, *zi* 自 belongs to the group of departing tone, and *yuan* 遠 belongs to the group of rising tone. Like this, though the third syllables in the both lines of a couplet are all deflected tones, they are different deflected tones each other.

In examining on the third syllables, another technique of harmonizing tones may be necessary to consider at the same time. It is the third technique called “mutually compensating” (*xiangcheng* 相承) as follows: In the five syllables of the first line of a couplet, if there are much more deflected tones than level tones, three level tones are used consecutively in the second line. The technique of employing three level tones may be used either toward the beginning or toward the end of a line from the third syllable. The result of these two will be the same.<sup>47)</sup> Among Wang Wei’s forty-one poems, this technique is not a

45) See *juan* 9 in *Wang Youcheng ji jianzhui*, *juan* 126 in *Quan Tang shi*. See also <https://ctext.org/text.pl?node=129370&if=gb> [2019.04.20.]. For English translation, Robinson, *Poems of Wang Wei*, p.85.

46) “護腰者，腰，謂五字之中第三字也；護者，上句之腰不宜與下句之腰同聲。然同去上入則不可用，平聲無妨也。” Kūkai, *Bunkyō hifuron*, p.14. See note 21.

47) “相承者，若上句五字之內，去上入字則多，而平聲極少者，則下句用三平承之。用三平之術，向上向下二途，其歸道一也。” Kūkai, *Bunkyō hifuron*, p.15. See note 21.

s visible as the other two techniques. Wang Wei's remedy for the changed syllables in the above-examples is to change the fourth syllable into a level tone (i.e. to change the original b type L L L D D into L L D L D).

Changing the third syllable of a line may change the pattern of the entire line completely, so it should be optional, not arbitrary. For this reason, the poet should determine the syllable according to the regulated verse patterns rather than arbitrary selections.

## 4. Conclusion

The formular – “The free alternation for the 1st, 3rd, 5th syllables and the strict regulation for the 2nd, 4th, 6th syllables” (for the five-syllable verse, it is “The free alternation for 1st and 3rd syllables, and the strict regulation for 2nd and 4th syllables”) – has been widely accepted in the prosody of the regulated verse. However, the first part of the formula, as mentioned above, is inaccurate and unacceptable, as well as inconsistent with the writing practice of the Tang. It means that the odd-numbered syllables of a line are not “freely” alternating. In order to get this conclusion, the various poetic theories and arguments of Wang Li and Kūkai such as the standard tonal patterns, the four tones, the eight faults, “odd remedy,” “single level-tone,” “changing the head,” “guarding the waist” and “mutually compensating,” etc. have been examined.

As a matter of fact, in the Tang, the main practical techniques for harmonizing tones are those such as “changing the head” and “guarding the waist” which are chiefly used in the odd-numbered syllables. The former emphasizes that: if only the second syllable of a line in a poem is contrasted, it is not the best sort of the technique, it is merely acceptable. Relevant to the definition, there is the so-called “level head” as a fault. That is, in a couplet, the first two syllables of the first line should not share the same tones with the first two syllables of the second line.

Wang Li argues that the formular is not applicable for B type of line because the first syllable of B type is strictly fixed in level tone in order to avoid the “single level-tone” in a line. Besides, the free alternation for the third syllable of a line is also limited.

We can say that the Tang poetic theories mainly devote great attention to the single tonal arrangement, which is naturally attributed to a literary reflection of an era when the new poetic forms arose and the tones were introduced. As the forms developed, the modern theories on the regulated verse at first paid attention to the patterns, and then to the tonal arrangement of a line for the further analysis. No matter what the approaches are, the tonal alternating for the odd-numbered syllables of a line has the certain regulations. It is not as arbitrary as the well-known formular.

## 【References】

- Bodman, Richard Wainwright. *Poetics and prosody in early mediaeval China: a study and translation of Kūkai's Bunkyo hifuron*. Ph. D. dissertation. New York: Cornell University, 1978.
- Bodman, Richard Wainwright and Shirleen S. Wong. "Shih 詩" in *The Indiana Companion to Traditional Chinese Literature*. Ed. by William H. Nienhauser, Jr. Bloomington, Indiana: Indiana UP, 1986. pp.682-689.
- Cao Yin 曹寅 (1658-1712) et al., comps. *Quan Tangshi* 全唐詩. Peking: Zhonghua shuju, 1960.
- Ding Bangxin 丁邦新, "Ping ze xin kao" 平仄新考, *Bulletin of the Institute of History and Philology Academia Sinica*, 47.1 (1975): pp.1-15.
- Gu Longzhen 顧龍振. *Shixue jinan* 詩學指南. Taipei: Guangwen, 1973.
- Hartman, Charles. "Poetry" in *The Indiana Companion to Traditional Chinese Literature*. Ed. by William H. Nienhauser, Jr. Bloomington, Indiana: Indiana UP, 1986. pp.59-74.
- Kūkai 空海 (774-835). *Bunkyo hifuron* 文鏡秘府論. Tōkyō: Kyūko Shoin, 1984.
- Liu Jian 劉鑑, ed. *Qieyun zhinan* 切韻指南. Taipei: Xin wenfeng chuban gongsi, 1989.
- Mei Zulin 梅祖麟, "Tones and prosody in Middle Chinese and the origin of the rising tone," *Harvard Journal of Asiatic Studies*, 30 (1970): pp.86-110.
- Nienhauser, William H. et al., comp. *The Indiana Companion to Traditional Chinese Literature*. Bloomington, Indiana: Indiana UP, 1986.
- Robinson, G. W., trans. *Poems of Wang Wei*. Harmondsworth: Penguin, 1973.
- Wang Li 王力 (1900-1986). *Hanyu shili xue* 漢語詩律學. Shanghai: Shanghai jiaoyu chubanshe, 2002.
- Wang Ryeok 왕력(王力). *Junggug siyul hak* 中國詩學, 4 Vols. Trans. by Song Yongjun 송용준. Seoul: Somyeong chulpan, 2005.
- Zhao Diancheng 趙殿成, ed. *Wang Youcheng ji jianzhu* 王右丞集箋注. Taipei: Taiwan Zhonghua shuju, 1985.
- Zhou Fagao 周法高, "Shuo ping ze" 說平仄, *Bulletin of the Institute of History and Philology Academia Sinica*, 13 (1948): pp.153-162.



## 【논문초록】

키워드 Key Words	국문	제1음절, 제3음절, 구, 오언시, 율시, 구결		
	영문	First Syllable, Third Syllable, Couplet, Regulated, Formular		
<div>오언율시 시구의 제1음절과 제3음절 연구</div> <div>Park, Min-Woong</div> <p>본 논문은 왕리 王力(1900-1986)의 『漢語詩律學』과 쿠카이 空海(774-835)의 『文鏡秘府論』을 근간으로 하여 五言律詩의 詩句 중 첫 번째 음절과 세 번째 음절의 운율을 살펴본 것이다. 그리고 그 예로 왕웨이 王維(699-761)의 시 열한 수를 들어 설명을 보태었다. 그러나 왕웨이의 詩 중에서도 平起式의 오언율시로 범위를 제한하여 살펴보았다. 본론에서는 먼저 서론에 이어, 왕리의 주장에 따른 율시의 기본과 격식을 소개하였고, 소위 중국시율학에서 과거 묵인되어 왔던 口訣인 ‘一三五不論, 二四六分明’을 통해 홀수 음절의 평측을 첫 번째와 세 번째 음절로 나누어 살펴보았다. 구결의 의미는 매구의 첫 번째 글자, 세 번째 글자 및 다섯 번째 글자는 평측의 구매 없이 자유로이 사용할 수 있으며, 두 번째 글자, 네 번째 글자 및 여섯 번째 글자는 평측을 구분하여 격식을 반드시 준수해야 하는 것으로 평성과 축성의 자기자리를 바꾸어서는 안 된다는 것인데, 칠언시 뿐 아니라 오언시에도 똑같이 적용되어지므로 구결을 오언시의 경우 ‘一三不論, 二四分明’이라 해도 무방하다. 이 구결은 출처는 불확실하지만 중국시율학에서 모르는 이가 없을 정도이나, 전반부인 ‘一三不論’은 잘못된 것으로, 唐代의 詩作에도 부합되지 않는다는 것이 왕리의 주장이다.</p> <p>이에 왕리와 쿠카이의 주장과 함께 平仄의 格式, 四聲, 八病, 拗救, 孤平, 換頭, 護腰, 相承 등을 살펴보았고, ‘一三不論’이라는 口訣은 합당하지 않음을 확인하였다. 이 과정에서 聲韻을 조화롭게 하는 주요 기술은 換頭와 護腰 따위로 주로 홀수 음절에서 사용된다는 것과, 구결의 내용과는 달리 홀수 음절 곧 첫 번째와 세 번째 글자(음절)의 평측 사용은 결코 자유롭지만 않으며, 특히 가운데 세 번째 음절의 경우 평측 교환으로 완전히 변해버릴 수 있으므로 선택적이어야지 임의적이어서는 안 됨을 확인하였다.</p>				
저 자 인적사항	성 명	박민웅 / 朴敏雄 / Park, Min-Woong		
	소 속	서경대학교 인문과학대 국제비즈니스어학부		
	Em@il	mwp1112@hotmail.com		
논 문 작성일시	투 고 일	2019년 05월 10일	심 사 일	2019년 05월 23일
	수 정 일	2019년 06월 15일	게재확정일	2019년 06월 18일